



**Quality Assurance and Compliance
Onsite Monitoring Visit**

**Adult Education and Family Literacy
and
Career and Technical Education**

Tallahassee Community College

September 14-17, 2015

Final Report



State Board of Education

Marva Johnson, *Chair*
John R. Padget, *Vice Chair*
Members
Gary Chartrand
Rebecca Fishman Lipsey
Michael Olenick
Andy Tuck

Pam Stewart
Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth, Chancellor
Division of Career and Adult Education

October 22, 2015

Dr. Jim Murdaugh, President
Tallahassee Community College
444 Appleyard Drive
Tallahassee, Florida 32304

Dear Dr. Murdaugh:

We are pleased to provide you with the final monitoring report for the adult education, and career and technical education programs at the Tallahassee Community College. The final report will also be placed on the Quality Assurance and Compliance website at <http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance>.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during our visit. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Tashi D. Williams, director of Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9033 or via electronic mail at Tashi.Williams@fldoe.org.

Thank you for your continuous commitment to improve educational services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/tdw

Enclosure

cc: Dr. Karen Hill, coordinator, Adult Education Program
Kate Stewart, dean, Technology and Professional Programs
Gloria Spradley-Brown, bureau chief, Grants Administration and Compliance
Tashi D. Williams, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance
Donna Waller, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance
Michael Swift, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Authority	1
III.	Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols	1
IV.	Provider Selection	1
V.	Tallahassee Community College	2
VI.	Monitoring Activities	3
VII.	Results	4
VIII.	Required Resolution Activities	7
IX.	Summary	7
	Appendix A	8

Florida Department of Education
Division of Career and Adult Education

**Tallahassee Community College
Adult Education and Family Literacy
and
Career and Technical Education
Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring Report**

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education (division), in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance section is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the quality assurance system is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE) for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins (Perkins) Career and Technical Education Act of 2006 and for Adult Education (AE) under the Adult Education and Family Literacy Act of 1998. FDOE awards subgrants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and adult education/family literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for subgrants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations pursuant to 34 CFR 76.770, Education Department General Administrative Regulations (EDGAR) and the Uniform Grant Guidance (UGG) for grant awards issued on or after December 26, 2014. The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of subgrantees in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes).

Additional citations noting pertinent laws and regulations and authority to monitor are located in the 2015-2016 Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols, Module A, Section 1.

III. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROTOCOLS

The Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols manual was revised in the 2015-16 program year. The manual is provided to each provider prior to the monitoring visit. The manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the manual in this document; which is located on the division's website at <http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance>.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the quality assurance system. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based.

Risk assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the department and the division. A risk matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors is completed for each provider. The risk matrix for each program monitored is located in Appendix A. The results of the risk assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy(ies) to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for Tallahassee Community College was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Dr. Murdaugh, president, Tallahassee Community College, on August 7, 2015. The designated representatives for the agency were Ms. Kate Stewart, dean, Technology and Professional Programs and Dr. Karen Hill, program coordinator, Center for Workforce Development Adult Education Programs.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted September 14-17, 2015 by three representatives of the Quality Assurance and Compliance section of the division: Tashi Williams, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance section and program specialists Donna Waller and Michael Swift.

V. TALLAHASSEE COMMUNITY COLLEGE

Enrollment: (possible duplications at the program level):

ENROLLMENT:

Fiscal Year (FY) 2013-14
Adult General Education
599

CTE Postsecondary
2,855 (possible duplication at the program level)

The provider was awarded the following grants for FYs 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16:

2013-2014

Adult Education and Family Literacy

<u>Program</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
Adult General Education	372-1914A-4CG01	\$ 139,942.00	\$ 9,160.97
Adult General Education	372-1914A-4CG02	\$ 87,693.00	\$ 16,578.09
English Literacy and Civic	372-1934A-4CE01	\$ 28,711.00	\$ 9,389.63
Adult Ed – Corrections	372-1914A-4CC01	\$ 31,289.00	\$ 7,069.68
Adult Ed – Corrections	372-1914A-4CC02	\$ 120,342.00	\$ 17,841.76

Career and Technical Education

<u>Program</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
Perkins - Postsecondary	372-1614A-4CP01	\$ 389,270.00	\$ 17,841.76

2014-2015

Adult Education and Family Literacy

<u>Program</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
Adult General Education	372-1915A-5CG01	\$ 136,643.00	\$ 46,473.96
Adult General Education	372-1915A-5CG02	\$ 75,028.00	\$ 9,369.28
English Literacy and Civic	372-1915A-5CE01	\$ 25,619.00	\$ 4,140.62

Career and Technical Education

<u>Program</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
Perkins - Postsecondary	372-1615A-5CP01	\$ 417,226.00	\$ 6,475.74

2015-2016

Adult Education and Family Literacy

<u>Program</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
Adult General Education	372-1916B-6CG01	\$ 136,643.00	N/A
Adult General Education	372-1916B-6CG02	\$ 75,028.00	N/A
English Literacy and Civic	372-1936B-6CE01	\$ 25,619.00	N/A

Career and Technical Education

<u>Program</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
Perkins - Postsecondary	372-1616A-6CP01	\$ 365,007.00	N/A

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address:

<https://www.tcc.fl.edu/>

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls; an entrance conference; interviews with administrators, teachers, and students; observations; record reviews; and an exit conference.

Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to the following locations:

- Tallahassee Community College, Center for Workforce Development
- New Birth Tabernacle Church
- The Quincy House
- Ghazvini Learning Center

Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for the Tallahassee Community College was conducted on September 14, 2015, and the exit conference was conducted on September 17, 2015. The participants are listed below:

Name	Title	Entrance Conference	Exit Conference
Dr. Karen Hill	Program Coordinator (TCC)	X	X
Alex Macy	Institutional Research (TCC)	X	X
Margaret Wingate	Institutional Research	X	X
Kimberly Moore	Vice President, Workforce Development	X	X
Kate Stewart	Dean, Technology and Professional Programs	X	X
Rick Frazier	Director, Business and Industry Service Center	X	X
Rowena Ford	Contracts and Grants Coordinator	X	X
FDOE MONITORING TEAM			
Tashi D. Williams	Director, FDOE Compliance	X	X
Donna Waller	Program Specialist, FDOE	X	X
Michael Swift	Program Specialist, FDOE	X	X

Interviews/Observations

Interviews and/or observations were conducted during the course of the visit with selected administrative staff, instructional staff and students. A minimum of seven interviews and observations were held during the onsite visit.

Records Review

Program, financial, administrative and/or student records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in section VII, item G. A minimum of 10 student records were reviewed. Some policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency's website and discussed at various times during the onsite visit.

VII. RESULTS

A. **ADMINISTRATION** refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.

- Administrators, faculty and students are devoted to the college and its AE and CTE programs.
- CTE advisory councils provide input and support to the CTE programs.
- Advisory councils include business leaders and people from surrounding communities.
- The administration is knowledgeable about their respective program areas.
- Administrators are informed and are eager to help the college and students.
- Administrators are dedicated to the success of students.
- The faculty is heavily involved in the college.

B. **DATA AND ASSESSMENT** refers to all the components of the data and assessment system, including test administration, test security, data collection, entry, and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.

- Verification of AE and CTE student data was completed during the course of the visit.
- The monitoring team provided a random list of students, and the college provided these student files for review and verification.
- The monitoring team verified industry certifications and occupational completion points (completers) earned by students.
- Data processes supported the submission of required reports by the department.
- The data is used when evaluating AE and CTE programs.
- Instructors and administrators have access to data.
- The Passport data system is used for capturing and maintaining student attendance, student records, course information and performance in AE.
- The Starfish data system is used for capturing and maintaining student attendance, student records, course information and performance in CTE.
- The college is transitioning from the Integrow data system to the Workday data system. The Workday data system is a program used to maintain human resource data, job-related information, salary information, benefits data and financial data.

C. **CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION** refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations.

- The AE and CTE programs were composed of experienced instructors.
 - Instructors were qualified and were generous with their attention to individual student success.
- Students were knowledgeable and were making progress toward degrees, certificates and/or industry certifications.
- Textbooks are current and are being used in classrooms.
- Teachers are using a variety of technology in their classrooms.
 - Equipment and technology is relevant and state-of-the-art.
- Programs offer an assortment of instructional and real experiences for students.
- A variety of instructional practices was observed during the visit, such as group learning, lectures, labs, individualized instruction via computer/software and textbook reviews.
- The college is following the curriculum frameworks as established by the department.

D. TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom; addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.

- Technology and equipment was in good condition and available to students at all locations.
- Technology was integrated into instruction.
- Technology was appropriate proportion to class sizes.
- A variety of technology was observed being used by faculty and students.

E. LEARNING ENVIRONMENT encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy, and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.

- The classrooms were conducive for learning.
- The classrooms appeared to be spacious and appropriate for class sizes.
- Applicable instructional materials were observed and being used in classes.
- Safety rules, where applicable, were posted in classrooms.
- The buildings and grounds appeared to be well maintained throughout the campus.

F. ACCESS AND EQUITY refers to compliance with the requirements of federal non-discrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation, and completion of programs.

For Colleges/Universities:

- The Office of Equity and Civil Rights Compliance (OECR), Division of Florida Colleges is responsible for monitoring and overseeing civil rights compliance obligations. Should you have any questions or concerns, please contact the OECR at 850-245-9468.

G. RECORDS REVIEW refers to a review of the records and documents that demonstrate compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed.

- Advisory council meeting minutes notes
- Student handbook and employee handbook
- College catalog
- Colleges website
- Student records
- Financial records (payroll, time and effort reports (personnel activity reports and certifications)), purchase orders, travel and expenditures) and financial policies and procedures
- College policies and procedures
- Completed AE and Perkins grant applications
- Final disbursement reports for AE and Perkins grants
- Program brochures
- Promotional activities

H. FINANCIAL refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management, and allowable costs.

- Purchasing procedures are in place and are being followed.
- Approval process is thorough and is being followed.
- Meetings are held regularly to discuss AE and Perkins grants.

- Documentation provided (payroll, time and effort reports (personnel activity reports and certifications), purchase orders, travel and expenditures) was comprehensive, organized, and systematic.

I. COLLABORATION refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or memoranda of understanding (MOUs) that are in place to benefit an agency’s programs and students.

- The college has a host of articulation agreements with various agencies such as:
 - Florida A&M University, Florida State University, University of West Florida, Leon County School District, Wakulla County School Board, Gadsden County School District and Taylor County School District

J. PERKINS LOCAL PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN - A Perkins local program improvement plan (PIP) is required when an agency does not meet 90% of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.

- Pursuant to the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Improvement Act of 2006 (Perkins IV), Section 123(b) (2), if a state finds that a local eligible agency has failed to meet agreed upon target levels as described in Section 113(b) (4) of the Act and is not making substantial progress in meeting the goals, the state will work with the agency to help implement improvement activities. Additionally, Section 123(b)(4)(A) of the law specifies that “If a local eligible agency fails to meet at least 90% of an agreed upon State adjusted level of performance for the same core indicator of performance for three (3) consecutive years then the state is required to provide technical assistance.”

The PIP’s were reviewed and discussed during the visit Tallahassee Community College and efforts are being made to meet or exceed all measures. The purpose of the review was to determine whether the strategies contained in the plan were measurable and verifiable during the visit.

Postsecondary Certificate Level

- For 2013-14, the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary measures except for:
 - 1A1 Technical Skills Local agreed 56.33% vs. 82.50% Local target
 - 2A1 Completion Local agreed 59.30% vs. 83.17% Local target

Postsecondary College Credit

- For 2013-14, the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary measures except for:
 - 1P1 Technical Skills Local agreed 39.17% vs. 44.50% Local target
 - 2P1 Completion Local agreed 40.53% vs. 47.50% Local target
 - 5P1 Non-traditional enrollment Local agreed 26.66% vs. 30.06% Local target
 - 5P2 Non-traditional Completion Local agreed 16.24% vs. 22.32% Local target

K. STUDENT PERSPECTIVE – The team meets with groups of students; their perspective is presented as a portion of this report.

- Students were complimentary of instructors, counselors and the administration.
- Students had direct access to plenty of resources such as books and on-line prep classes.
- Students are made aware of job opportunities.
- Students like the individual attention they receive from instructors.
- Information regarding financial aid and other resources are readily available for students.
- Students expressed pride in their programs, the college, the campuses, instructors and the facilities.
- Students from Gadsden County were complimentary of transportation offered through the Gadsden county connector program and Big Bend Transit.

- Student’s main goals were to transfer to a University to receive a bachelor’s degree or find a job in their field of study that would yield a higher income.
- Information was provided on the following Career and Technical Student Organizations (CTSOs):
 - The Eagle Business Society
 - The Engineering Club
 - The Computer Club (TC4)

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

ADULT EDUCATION AND FAMILY LITERACY

1. Corrective Action Plan (findings) – Tallahassee Community College is not required to complete a corrective action plan.
2. Action Plan (concerns) – Tallahassee Community College is not required to complete an action plan.

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

1. Corrective Action Plan (findings) - Tallahassee Community College is not required to complete a corrective action plan.
2. Action Plan (concerns) – Tallahassee Community College is not required to complete an action plan.

IX. SUMMARY

Once the field work is completed, including receipt of requested information, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The final report is completed, forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties, and is posted on the department’s website at the following address: <http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-du/compliance>.

Finally, the division issues a closure notice to the agency head and contact designees. This notice indicates all outstanding resolution items if applicable, have been completed.

On behalf of the department, the monitoring team extends our appreciation to all participants in the Tallahassee Community College onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks are offered to Ms. Kate Stewart, dean, Technology and Professional Programs and Dr. Karen Hill, program coordinator, Center for Workforce Development Adult Education Programs for their participation and leadership in this process.

APPENDIX A

Tallahassee Community College
Adult Education and Family Literacy
Risk Matrix

Risk Scores Matrix for Colleges Receiving Adult Education (AE) Grants					
Agency Name: Tallahassee Community College					
Program type: ADULT EDUCATION					
Target Year: 2013-2014					
Monitoring Year: 2015-2016					
Metric	Scaling	Point Value	Points Assigned	Weight	Total Metric Points
Total AE Budget Allocated Value	Upper Quartile	7	5	X 10	50
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
# AE Grants Value	4+	7	7	X 8	56
	3	5			
	2	3			
	1	1			
AE Director Change Value	Yes	7	7	X 6	42
	No	0			
AE Funds Remaining Point Value	Upper Quartile	7	7	X 4	28
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
OAG Findings Value	Upper Quartile	7	7	X 4	28
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
AGENCY RISK SCORE:					204

*Compliance monitoring last visit: **Fall 2009**

*Data sources used for calculations: **Prior to July 1, 2014**

Tallahassee Community College
 Career and Technical Education
 Risk Matrix

Risk Scores Matrix for Colleges Receiving Career and Technical Education (CTE) Carl D. Perkins Grants					
Agency Name: Tallahassee Community College					
Program type: CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION					
Target Year: 2013-2014					
Monitoring Year: 2015-2016					
Metric	Scaling	Point Value	Points Assigned	Weight	Total Metric Points
Total Perkins Budget Allocated Value	Upper Quartile	7	3	X 10	30
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
# Perkins Grants Value	4+	7	1	X 8	8
	3	5			
	2	3			
	1	1			
Perkins PIP Index Value	7.50 – 10.00	7	3	X 8	24
	5.00 – 7.49	5			
	2.50 – 4.99	3			
	0<index<2.50	1			
	0	0			
Perkins Director Change Value	Yes	7	0	X 6	0
	No	0			
Perkins Funds Remaining Point Value	Upper Quartile	7	7	X 4	28
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
OAG Findings Value	Upper Quartile	7	7	X 4	28
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
AGENCY RISK SCORE:					118

*Compliance monitoring last visit: **CTE, Fall 2009**

*Data sources used for calculations: **Prior to July 1, 2014**